

ARCHIVUM FRANCISCANUM HISTORICUM

PERIODICA PUBLICATIO
PP. COLLEGII S. BONAVENTURAE



Annus 113

Ianuarius - Iunius 2020 - Fasc. 1-2

PROPRIETAS LITTERARIA

Fondazione Collegio S. Bonaventura
Fratr Editori di Quaracchi
Via Vecchia di Marino, 28-30
00046 GROTTAFERRATA (Roma) Italia

Director Periodici: Benedikt Mertens, OFM

Consilium Redactionis: Antonio Ciceri, OFM • Pierre Moracchini • Michael J.P. Robson • Rafael Sanz, OFM

Secretarius Periodici: Juri Leoni, OFM

Consilium scientificum: Maria Pia Alberzoni (Università Cattolica S. Cuore, Milan) • Michael Cusato, OFM (Academy of American Franciscan History, Washington, D.C.) • Fortunato Iozzelli, OFM (Pontificia Università Antonianum, Rome) • Annette Kehnel (Universität Mannheim) • Frédéric Meyer (Université Savoie Mont Blanc, Chambéry) • Francisco Morales, OFM (Universidad de Puebla) • Amanda Power (University of Oxford) • Rafael Ramis Barceló (Universitat de les Illes Balears, Palma de Mallorca) • Bert Roest (Radboud University, Nijmegen) • Bernd Schmies (Fachstelle Franziskanische Forschung, Münster) • Laure Solignac (Institut Catholique de Paris) • Daniele Solvi (Università degli Studi della Campania “Luigi Vanvitelli”, Caserta) • Ludovic Viallet (Université Clermont Auvergne, Clermont-Ferrand) • Paolo Vian (Archivio Apostolico Vaticano)

Directio Periodici:

Archivum Franciscanum Historicum
Fratr Editori di Quaracchi
Collegio S. Isidoro
Via degli Artisti, 41
00187 ROMA, Italia
Tel. (+39) 3201537073 Fax (+39) 06.4884459
E-mail: rivistaafh@yahoo.it
Internet: <https://www.quaracchi.org/afh/>;
<https://www.quaracchi.org/en/afh/>

Administratio:

Fratr Editori di Quaracchi
Fondazione Collegio S. Bonaventura
Via S. Maria Mediatrice, 25
00165 ROMA, Italia
Tel./Fax: (+39) 06.68491286 Tel.: (+39) 06.68491287
E-mail: quaracchi@ofm.org

Modalità di pagamento:

BancoPosta: IBAN IT76 CIN N ABI 07601 CAB 03200 CONTO 000089902001
BIC/SWIFT PIBPITRA

Intestazione: Fratr Editori di Quaracchi

Banca Popolare di Sondrio: IBAN IT61 K056 9603 2110 0000 4843 X94
BIC/SWIFT POSOIT22ROM

Intestazione: Fratr Editori di Quaracchi.

Anno 2020 subscriptionis pretium est:

In Italia: € 55,00
Extra Italiam: € 70,00

Submitted articles are subjected to a single-blind evaluation.

PDF files of AFH since 2013 (entire issues/single articles) may be purchased at:
<http://www.libreriadelsanto.it/reparti/ebook/ebook---riviste/4098.html>

ISSN: 0004-0665

di coraggio si sarebbe potuto intitolare l'intero volume *De puritate cordis. De perfectione religiosorum (Trattato della purità del cuore)*, vista l'attenzione che la C. mostra verso la versione latina e che, come sempre credo con buone argomentazioni, collochi la versione volgare *G* in una fase forse successiva alla versione di *P*. Questo ritengo, infatti, sia la grande novità all'interno del panorama delle opere della Varano che la presente pubblicazione offre, portando finalmente un progresso al riguardo e dando prova della capacità della scrittrice camerte di saper ben dominare registri linguistici diversi.

Fanno parte della presente edizione un glossario (105-7), un'appendice dove viene trascritta una *Meditazione sopra la Cantica di Salomone* (109-13) conservata in *G*, testo inedito che può essere attribuito alla Varano, anche se la questione dell'autenticità non viene approfondita dalla C., se non per il fatto che è conservato del ms. di Genova che trasmette altre opere della clarissa camerte e che presenta stilemi e forme comuni ad altre sue opere. Concludono il presente volume gli Indici delle tavole, delle citazioni bibliche e dei nomi propri e di luogo (115-29) e le tavole con la riproduzione di alcuni fogli dei testimoni mss. Si segnala a questo riguardo l'assenza di due strumenti che sarebbero stati utili per il lettore e per la consultazione del volume quali una Bibliografia (c'è però un elenco di abbreviazioni e sigle bibliografiche di parte della letteratura citata, ix-x) e un Indice delle fonti che aiuterebbe ad approfondire la conoscenza della cultura dell'autrice. La C. del volume ha pubblicato recentemente un'esaustiva lista di *Errata corrige in Forma Sororum* 57/1 (2020) 61-3, alla quale rimando per chi volesse approfondire. Ad una lettura del testo e dell'apparato critico della versione volgare si sarebbero potute conservare alcune lezioni di *G* senza ricorrere all'emendazione *ope codicum* con le varianti di *CNV* (= γ): §18, *al proprio marito*, complemento che può essere retto dal verbo *stai avanti* (13); § 21, forse non era necessario completare la citazione di Cant. 4,8 con il testo di γ e nello stesso paragrafo era sufficiente correggere *humilli* con *hinnuli* senza aggiungere, confrontando il passo con quanto riportato da *P* cui *G* è redazionalmente vicino (14-15); § 33 il pronomine relativo *nella qual* può ben riferirsi al vocabolo *pietra* e, quindi, poteva essere conservato anziché preferire la lezione di γ *nelli quali* (21); § 111 forse *allegrezza* potrebbe essere considerata *lectio difficilior* e, quindi, la lezione *larghezza* trasmessa da γ sarebbe esito di una banalizzazione (67).

La presente edizione risulta un contributo importante nel quadro della conoscenza della produzione trattatistica umanistico-rinascimentale in ambito clariano osservante e sarà un utile strumento per tutti coloro che vorranno approfondirne la lettura e lo studio.

JURI LEONI, OFM
Editori di Quaracchi, Roma

MOLNÁR, ANTAL. – *Confessionalization on the Frontier. The Balkan Catholics between Roman Reform and Ottoman Reality*. – 00198 Roma, Viella (www.viella.it), via delle Alpi 32, 2019. – 240 x 170 mm, 266 p. – (*Interadria. Culture dell'Adriatico* 22).- € 40,00

In his latest work, the Hungarian historian Antal Molnár (Institute of History, Research Centre for the Humanities, Budapest), gathers nine essays which had previously been published in several languages and now appear in an

updated English version. In his research, Molnár deals with Church history and cultural history of the early modern period, the cultural and institutional history of Rome and the Holy See in the 16th and 17th centuries, and the history of the Balkans under the Ottoman rule. The nine thematic chapters of this book, in one way or another, summarize all the areas of Molnár's research interest.

In the introduction (ch. 1, pp. 7-16), the author explains his approach and research methodology concerning the outlined topics. As an expert in the history of the early modern period, the ecclesiastical circumstances of the time, and the complexity of the Balkan region, he demonstrates an excellent knowledge of the issues involved. He interprets this complex reality with sovereignty, both in the introduction and throughout the book. Molnár is not prone to stereotypes or a superficial approach or definition of the very term "Balkans." Although he occasionally refers to specific geographical features of the term, he considers and interprets it somewhat culturally, including in the Balkans, only those countries that were under the Ottoman rule for several centuries. His solid knowledge of the cultural history of the early modern period makes him distinguish very well between the peoples of South-Eastern Europe who belong to the sphere of Central European cultural influence and those in which centuries-old Ottoman rule left a more lasting impact. Thereby he excludes explicitly from the Balkans the Croatian and Hungarian territories, which were ruled by the Ottomans until the end of the 17th century. In those lands, the remnants of Ottoman influence are insignificant—that is, neither enduring nor exclusive—while a clear Central European cultural continuity has been present since the Middle Ages. Molnár's expertise and strictly scholarly attitude are also manifest in his treatment of the topics proposed in his nine chapters since he does not approach this extremely complex reality intending to create a complete and rounded picture. Instead, he discusses the selected problems to illustrate the religious, ethnic, and cultural features of the countries that he classifies within the cultural sphere of the Balkans: Albania, Serbia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, and the area of the former Sanjak of Novi Pazar. In certain parts and regarding specific issues, he also touches upon the former territory of southern Hungary (present-day Voivodina in Serbia) and parts of the Hungarian Kingdom under the Ottoman rule, as well as the Croatian lands in that sphere of influence during the 16th and 17th centuries.

The area of the Balkans, especially its western part, underwent significant cultural fractures in the early modern period. It was a unique space where precisely in this period, in the 16th and 17th centuries, the peculiarity of the conflict between several European realities was manifest: the conflict between Catholicism and the Reformation, the Catholic renewal, the way in which these processes spilled over into the territory of non-Christian Ottoman rule, the strong presence of Orthodoxy, and the dominant political and social influence of Islam. A strong impetus of the Catholic renewal was evident, which transcended the borders of Catholic European monarchies and penetrated the complex reality of the western part of the Ottoman Empire, which Molnár culturally refers to as the Balkans, encompassing thereby certain historical-geographical and political spaces as well as ethnic groups. The frontier area between the Catholic Habsburg Empire, Venice, and Dubrovnik, on the one hand, and the Islamic military-theocratic Ottoman Empire on the other was, in fact, the most complex European

territory of the early modern period, additionally challenged by the presence of Orthodoxy. Again, in tackling this complex scenario, Molnár shows his considerable expertise as he deals with certain historical realities of the area without haphazardly aspiring to completeness, respecting instead the very demanding and, on all levels, intricate issues in some of the lands that he has included in his Balkans. And this is the only possible and correct way to portray in a scholarly way the process of confessionalization in the frontier area of Catholic Central Europe and the Islamic Ottoman Empire, at a time of intense Catholic renewal in the harsh reality of the Ottoman state in the Western Balkans.

The second chapter, "Bosnian Franciscans between Roman Centralization and Balkan Confessionalization" (17-30), is dedicated to the strongest and most important component of the Catholic presence in the area, namely the Franciscans of the Province of Bosnia Argentina of the Holy Cross. In this chapter, Molnár aptly exemplifies the indispensable role of the Bosnian Franciscans in this region from the Middle Ages and the beginning of their mission in the then Bosnian Kingdom, through their survival during the Ottoman invasion and rule, to the significant expansion of the Bosnian Franciscans beyond the borders of the dissolved Bosnian Kingdom. Finally, he analyses their role in the attempts of Rome to implement the Catholic renewal in a reality it did not know well, as well as the relative success of the Catholic renewal, or the confessionalization process, conducted by the Bosnian Franciscans: not quite according to the instructions of Propaganda Fide and the Holy See, but suitable to the reality of the Ottoman Empire. Addressing this topic as one of primary importance, the author shows that the Bosnian Franciscans, often torn between the demands of Rome and the harsh reality of the Ottoman Empire, were the key factor in the process of confessionalization in the frontier region.

Dealing with the significant Catholic institutions, starting from the Franciscans in chapter two, Molnár addresses in the following section other vital institutions from the beginnings of the Catholic renewal. "The Holy Office and the Balkan Missions before the Foundation of the Congregation of Propaganda Fide (1622)" (31-46) offers an analysis of the operation of the Holy See with its reliance on the Bosnian Franciscans and the Jesuits in their missionary work in Bulgaria and the Ottoman parts of Hungary before missionary work was centralized by establishing the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith in 1622. Here, the author analyses the successes of Franciscan and Jesuit missionaries in specific western parts of the Ottoman Empire, with all its complex reality, and the problems that arose with the founding of the Congregation and the centralization of missionary work, once again bringing into conflict the strict requirements of Rome and the reality in situ.

Other key issues are addressed in the following chapters: "Venetian South-Eastern Europe and Ottoman Hungary" (47-64), "Struggle for the Chapel of Belgrade (1612-1643)" (65-122), and "Struggle for the Chapel of Novi Pazar (1627-1630)" (123-34). In three separate topics concerning different religious and ethnic areas of the Ottoman Empire, Molnár depicts specific processes of confessionalization in which the main instigators and bearers were the Catholic states of Dubrovnik and Venice, both important trading partners of the Ottoman Empire. Here the author assesses the presence of Venice in the Empire and its role in the confessionalization processes in an area beyond its historical interest

and even political reach, which is Ottoman Hungary. The other two parts discuss the importance of Dubrovnik for the economy of the Ottoman state, as well as its political and social role in the said processes, for example, the attempt to build chapels for Catholic worship in Belgrade and Novi Pazar.

The remaining four chapters touch on some more specific topics regarding the Balkan area and the confessionalization processes in the 17th century. The chapter “The Catholic Missions and the Origins of Albanian Nation-Building at the Beginning of the 17th Century” (135-52) reflects in detail on the barely known influence of Catholicism and individual Church representatives on the creation of a national conscience among the Albanians in the context of missionary work. Here Molnár traces the development and flourishing of this national idea in the 17th century as well as its collapse in the 18th century. One of the crucial features of Catholic renewal and confessionalization in Europe during the 17th century was the endeavor to unite the Orthodox with Rome. The author addresses this inevitable process, observable over a wide area from the Baltic to the Aegean Sea, in the eighth chapter “The Serbian Orthodox Church and the Attempts at Union with Rome in the 17th Century” (157-64). The flourishing of Catholic missions in the European part of the Ottoman Empire and their downfall in the second half of the 17th century are discussed in the chapter “The Balkan Missions under the Pontificate of Innocent XI (1676-1689): from Apogee to Ruin” (169-82). These missions were dissolved during the Great Turkish War (1683-99), which marked the end of the confessionalization processes in the Balkans, due to significant geopolitical and social changes. The chapter ends with the beginnings of a mission renewal after the end of the war, under new conditions that were in fundamental contrast to those of the 17th century. Finally, in the tenth chapter, “La Schiavona: A Bosnian Girl between Catholic hagiography and Balkan Female Transvestism” (183-204), Molnár focuses on a historiographically quite unusual topic, using the story of Magdalena Pereš-Vuksanović to present the complexities of space and time and to show certain ethnic peculiarities that strongly conditioned the processes of confessionalization in the Balkans. Her biography, transmitted in a unique manuscript, brings us closer to the everyday life, opportunities, and constraints experienced by catholic women in the European part of the Ottoman Empire.

Antal Molnár’s book is an exceptionally valuable scholarly work written by a true expert on the cultural concepts and determinants of the Balkans, its ethnicities, and religious-confessional processes. Molnár accurately traces, interprets, and exemplifies the processes which are announced in the book title and thematically covered in its nine essays.

DANIEL PATAFTA, OFM
University of Zagreb, Croatia

SORELLE CLARISSE - CASAGRANDE, GIOVANNA (a cura). – *Memoriale per le suore del Monastero di S.ta Agnese Del’Acettare, prender l’Habito, Professione et Morte*. Con la collaborazione di ANDREA MAIARELLI e MAURO PAPALINI. – 06081 S. Maria degli Angeli - Assisi (PG), Edizioni Porziuncola (www.edizioniporziuncola.it), via dei Protomartiri 2, 2018. – 240 x 165 mm, 280 p., 4 fotogr. col. – (*Nova Archiva* 5).- € 32,00